The Library of Aḥmad Pasha al-Jazzār

Book Culture in Late Ottoman Palestine

EDITED BY

SAID ALJOUMANI, GUY BURAK

AND KONRAD HIRSCHLER

ISLAMIC HISTORY AND CIVILIZATION. STUDIES AND TEXTS

BRILL

The Library of Aḥmad Pasha al-Jazzār

Islamic History and Civilization

STUDIES AND TEXTS

VOLUME 219

The titles published in this series are listed at *brill.com/ihc*

The Library of Aḥmad Pasha al-Jazzār

Book Culture in Late Ottoman Palestine

Edited by

Said Aljoumani
Guy Burak
Konrad Hirschler

BRILL

LEIDEN | BOSTON

Cover illustration: The Jazzār Mosque in the early 1920s after the library had undergone a significant revival, photo by Ludwig Preiss, public domain, accessed at https://commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/File:PikiWiki_Israel_51654_the_al_jazar_mosque_in_acre.jpg

The Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data is available online at https://catalog.loc.gov
LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2024051300

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: "Brill". See and download: brill.com/brill-typeface.

ISSN 0929-2403
ISBN 978-90-04-72053-4 (hardback)
ISBN 978-90-04-72052-7 (e-book)
DOI 10.1163/9789004720527

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

Contents

Acknowledgements

We are grateful to Nada Moumtaz who provided us with a copy of the inventory and sparked the Jazzār Library Project. The Board of Trustees of the Jazzār Mosque in Acre warmly welcomed us and its members, particularly Hussam Tafesh, were wonderful partners throughout the project. We thank all the participants and contributors to the Jazzār Library Project for their efforts, intellectual generosity and enthusiasm. The work on this volume could not have been done without the support of librarians, curators, archivists and digitisers in numerous institutions worldwide. Their assistance has been indispensable. Colleagues who have generously shared their time and knowledge in identifying manuscripts of the Jazzār library distributed across the world include Adel El-Awadi (United Arab Emirates), Al Mahdi Al Rawadieh (University of Jordan), Mohammad Alsorayiea (Qassim University), Ahmed Abd El Baset (Institute of Arabic Manuscripts, Cairo), Bashir Barakat (Jerusalem), Vincent Engelhardt, Samah Hijab (Acre), Lina Jabali (National Library of Israel), Mahmoud Jabr (Cairo), Ahmet Kaylı (Istanbul), Yusuf al-Uzbaki (Masjid al-Aqsa Library) and Mahmoud Zaki (Qatar National Library). The Centre for the Study of Manuscript Cultures (CSMC) at Universität Hamburg has generously supported this project. We thank Maria Luisa Russo and Doreen Schröter for running the safeguarding project at the Jazzār Mosque. Philip Saunders meticulously edited the chapters. The support of Teddi Dols and Mona Saif of Brill was invaluable.

Figures and Tables

Figures

Tables

Contributors

Berat Açıl
Boğazici University

Asad Q. Ahmed
University of California, Berkeley

Said Aljoumani
Universität Hamburg

Yasin Arslantaş
Anadolu University

Christopher Bahl
Durham University

Guy Burak
New York University

Claudia Colini
Universität Hamburg

Garrett Davidson
College of Charleston

Konrad Hirschler
Universität Hamburg

Kyle Ann Huskin
Universität Hamburg

Nimet İpek
Sabancı University

Hadel Jarada
Wesleyan University

Feras Krimsti
Gotha Research Library of the University of Erfurt

Boris Liebrenz
The Saxon Academy of Sciences and Humanities in Leipzig

Shady H. Nasser
Harvard University

Benedikt Reier
Universität Hamburg

Liana Saif
University of Amsterdam

Dana Sajdi
Boston College

Walid A. Saleh
University of Toronto

Khalil Sawan
Boston College

Karin Scheper
University Libraries Leiden

Deborah Schlein
Princeton University

Ahmed El Shamsy
University of Chicago

CHAPTER 7

A (Mostly) Local Story: The Translocations of al-Jazzār's Books in the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries

Konrad Hirschler

The manuscripts described [in this catalogue] do not constitute the original al-Jazzār library. Rather, what was identified only represents a small fraction, because many of the [original library's] manuscripts have been lost for one reason or another.[1]

This statement by Maḥmūd ʿAlī ʿAṭāʾ Allāh, the great twentieth-century cataloguer of Palestinian book collections, in the introduction to his catalogue of the Jazzār library in 1983, throws up this chapter's core questions: Where have all the books gone that once constituted al-Jazzār's splendid library in Acre and how did these translocations happen?[2] How can we, in other words, write the history of the process that ʿAṭāʾ Allāh described with the opaque phrase 'many of the [original library's] manuscripts have been lost for one reason or another'? The loss of handwritten books from Acre has been massive: When the inventory was written in 1221/1806 the library held 1,820 volumes, in 1983 ʿAṭāʾ Allāh listed, as our analysis shows, just fourteen of them.[3] This chapter, thus, explores the fate of the 1,806 volumes that are no longer in Acre and their possible trajectories between the year 1806 and the present day. The development of the library over the last 200 years, including the translocations of almost all of its handwritten books, has been unchartered territory so far. Yet, it is possible to shine a light on some periods, and among them, is a story entirely untold to date, namely, the revival of the Jazzār *madrasa* and, hence, its library in the early twentieth century.

This chapter has two main argumentative axes: Firstly, it argues that the extraction of books from the Jazzār library was a prolonged and multifaceted process stretching most likely from the 1820s to around 1900. As is the case with many other historical libraries, dissolution cannot be pinned to one particular moment that saw all the books of the Jazzār library move into the possession of new owners. Nor was there a dramatic point of destruction that saw the library's books perish in fire or warfare. Rather than looking for one such spectacular turning point, we have to reconstitute a lengthy process that led to the gradual dismantlement of the library. In that sense, the post-al-Jazzār development of the library is quite similar to how it was built. As Boris Liebrenz argues in Chapter 3, the stocking of the library was probably not the result of spectacular raids, plunder and warfare but rather a protracted process involving multiple strategies, including purchasing books.

1 ʿAṭāʾ Allāh, *Fihris ʿAkkā*, 1983, p. ج. The research for this chapter was funded by the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft (DFG, German Research Foundation) under Germany's Excellence Strategy—EXC 2176 'Understanding Written Artefacts: Material, Interaction and Transmission in Manuscript Cultures', project no. 390893796. The research was conducted within the scope of the Centre for the Study of Manuscript Cultures (CSMC) at Universität Hamburg.

2 This chapter will use the term 'book' for handwritten codices and where pertinent, 'printed book'. 'Manuscripts', by contrast, refers to all handwritten artefacts and is not used here (see Lorusso, *Definition*, 2015).

3 ʿAṭāʾ Allāh also described sixty-four additional handwritten books. These were, as argued below, added to the collection from the late nineteenth-century onwards.

As is the case for many other historical libraries, the dismantlement of the Jazzār library and the translocation of its books cannot be deduced from external sources, such as reports in chronicles, travel reports and newspapers; these sources are simply silent on the library for most of the nineteenth century.[4] Nor do we have any internal sources from the Jazzār library itself, such as further inventories written in the course of the nineteenth century. Instead, the translocation of the library's books has to be primarily reconstructed from the books themselves by following the textual and material traces they carry. These traces show us a multitude of individual trajectories with numerous individuals taking ownership of books from the library at different points in time.

That we are looking at a gradual and lengthy process is indicated by those books providing firm dates for when they left the library. The earliest definite date we have is a book that is in the Khalidi Library in Jerusalem today. In 1245/1829–1830, some twenty-five years after al-Jazzār's death, a new owner, a certain Ibrāhīm ʿAbd al-Muʿṭī, proudly inscribed his ownership of Ibn al-ʿArabī's *Futūḥāt al-Makkiyya* on the book's title page.[5] Another former al-Jazzār book, today in the National Library of Israel, went into the possession of a new owner, ʿAbd al-Qādir al-Dajānī, in 1268/1851–1852.[6] In contrast to these early departures, we have books that stayed in the library for many more decades and we even have those fourteen books that are still in Acre today.

The argument that the process of extracting books was a gradual one is supported by the fact that the library was not dismantled right after the death of al-Jazzār. An endowment is particularly vulnerable upon its founder's death. This was particularly true in the case of al-Jazzār, as his succession was contentious and as the Ottoman centre started confiscation proceedings straight after his death (see Chapter 5 by Yasin Arslantaş). However, there are no notes in the books themselves, nor narrative reports or other documentary evidence that indicate a massive extraction of books in the years after his death in 1804. At the same time, reports from European travellers, discussed by Boris Liebrenz in Chapter 3, describe a fully functioning library in the years after al-Jazzār's death. Charles Lewis Meryon (1783–1877), for instance, visited the Acre Mosque in 1810, six years after al-Jazzār's death, and described the library as 'most splendid'.[7]

That the Jazzār library was not dismantled immediately after his death is corroborated by two striking absences. Firstly, if the books had been confiscated by the Ottoman centre, we would probably have found a large number of them in libraries in Istanbul, yet, there are only three al-Jazzār books known so far that have made their way to Istanbul. Secondly, if the Ottoman centre had confiscated the books but did not take them to Istanbul, they would have flooded the book markets of southern Greater Syria (Bilād al-Shām). That this was not so is evident from cases that include that of Muḥammad Aghā Abū Nabbūt (d. ca. 1833–1834). This former *mamlūk* and deputy of al-Jazzār built a large library in southern Greater Syria, in Jaffa, in the years after al-Jazzār's

4 The only evidence known so far is a document dated 1855 that mentions the repair of damaged structures at the Jazzār complex, including the library (see Chapter 5). This does not give any insight into the number of books in the library, but shows that there was, at least, still a dedicated library space.

5 Jerusalem, Khalidi Library, MS 1060, fol. 1[a]: (cf. https://www.vhmml.org/readingRoom/view/509558) [accessed 3 January 2023]

دخل في نوبة الفقير إليه تعالى / إبراهيم عبد المعطي المروزي / وقد [كلام مطموس] [خمس وأربعين] ومايتين وألف 1245

6 Jerusalem, National Library of Israel, AP Ar. 258, fol. 1[a] (with seal dated to 1268):

هذا الكتّاب من من ذي المن دام مَنُّه على الفقير إليه سبحانه السيد عبد القادر أبو رباح الدجاني الحنفي الأحمدي الخلوتي القادري الرفاعي الدسوقي خادم العلم والطريق بمدينة يافا عفى عنه بمنه آمين.

7 Meryon, *Travels of Lady Hester Stanhope*, I, 262.

death, as discussed in Chapter 6 by Benedikt Reier. Among almost 150 handwritten books from this library that Benedikt Reier has identified, we were not able to identify a single one that had previously been in al-Jazzār's ownership. That al-Jazzār's books were seemingly not available in the local book market when Abū Nabbūt built up his library in the 1810s and 1820s indicates an impressive stability of the Jazzār library after its founder's death.

The second argumentative strand of this chapter is that the main actors deciding the fate of the Jazzār library were individuals situated in Greater Syria. Their agency is evident from looking at the identity of the respective first owner after a book left the Jazzār library: As we will see in the following, individuals situated within Greater Syria constitute the vast majority, while individuals or institutions situated in Egypt, Istanbul or Europe did not play a salient role in extracting books from the library. It was not only individuals based in Greater Syria who extracted a lot of books from the library, we also find those who strove to rebuild the library in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. These rebuilding efforts were part of the reconfiguration and revival of the region's libraries during that period. They are often little-known individuals whose contribution to developing a 'modern' topography of libraries in the region is underacknowledged to date. Most importantly for this chapter, they were the driving force in 're-endowing' al-Jazzār books that had been translocated. They returned these books into an endowment context in either their original library in Acre or a new endowment library in cities such as Jerusalem.

1 Looking beyond Istanbul and Europe

Regarding books that were removed from a library in the Arabic lands in the nineteenth and early twentieth century, two main sets of historical actors who might have driven this development come to mind: institutions or individuals based in the Ottoman centre in Istanbul and those linked with European colonial expansion. After the incorporation of Greater Syria and Egypt into the Ottoman Empire in the early sixteenth century, vast numbers of books did indeed make their way to Istanbul, a veritable book drain. At some points, this might have been an act of military force,[8] but more often, the movement of books to Istanbul was a more complex process where trade, economic wealth and geographies of scholarship were important factors.[9] Berat Açıl showed this with the example of the Cârullah Efendi collection from the late seventeenth and early eighteenth centuries, currently housed in the Süleymaniye Library in Istanbul.[10] In the same vein, almost all known books of the Damascene Ashrafiyya library, which was dissolved in the early sixteenth century, are today in Istanbul.[11] Yet, there are very few al-Jazzār books in the libraries of Istanbul, just three to be precise.[12] It seems that by the nineteenth century, the centripetal movement of books to the city had come to an end as the Ottoman centre ceased to attract large numbers of books from the provinces. The Jazzār library might even indicate a more far-reaching change in the relationship between centre and province regarding the movement of books: As Boris Liebrenz shows in Chapter 3, Istanbul was one of the main places from where al-Jazzār bought books to build up his library. Rather than books moving from the provinces to the centre, the Jazzār library indicates a process of books moving from the centre to the provinces.[13] In the

8 Aleppo inventory: Bağcı/Yürekli, "Book-Picking"; D'hulster, *Browsing through the Sultan's Bookshelves*.

9 For some preliminary remarks see Hirschler, *Plurality and Diversity in an Arabic Library*, 51–53.

10 Acıl, *Osmanlı kitap kültürü*.

11 Hirschler, *Plurality and Diversity in an Arabic Library*.

12 Istanbul, Süleymaniye Library, Yazma Bağışlar 766, Pertevniyal V. Sultan 759 and Kemankes 21.

13 The fact that members of the Khalidi family bought many books in the eighteenth century in Istanbul indicates the same trend. This research has not been published yet and my statement is based on the notes retrieved by Boris Liebrenz and Said Aljoumani.

process of building up his local polity, al-Jazzār not only made references to the material topography of Istanbul (see the *Introduction* to this volume), but also appropriated moveable artefacts from the centre.

Do we, thus, have to turn to European institutions and actors to understand the movement of al-Jazzār's books? Ahmed El Shamsy spoke, for instance, of a massive 'book drain' to conceptualise the movement of Arabic handwritten books to Europe, especially in the course of the nineteenth century.[14] Yet, among the seventy-eight al-Jazzār books identified so far only twenty-two moved to European or US American libraries. A ratio of twenty-eight per cent is substantial, but it does not sustain the impression of a massive movement of books. What is more, this ratio is arguably misleading, owing to selection bias, and should be lower still: It is calculated based on our current corpus of seventy-eight identified al-Jazzār books, which is relatively small and—more importantly—arguably includes an overproportionate number of European and US American collections. The holdings of libraries in Europe and the US are relatively easy to access (online or in person) and they are, thus, much better represented in research corpora such as ours. The possibility that we have simply missed a large corpus of al-Jazzār books in one of these libraries is, therefore, comparatively low, while it is very likely for libraries in West Asia and North Africa. This is especially true for our corpus, as Boris Liebrenz focused in particular on European and US American libraries in his many years of work gathering notes from handwritten books (see *Introduction* to this volume). As a result, his original corpus of twenty-two al-Jazzār books mostly came from Princeton, Dublin, London, Berlin and Leipzig libraries. The ratio of al-Jazzār books in European and US American libraries was sixty-eight per cent in Boris Liebrenz' corpus, and it is telling that this ratio dropped to twenty-eight per cent just by enlarging the corpus to seventy-eight books. I am, thus, convinced that the growing size of the Jazzār corpus will push in coming years the ratio of such books in European and US American collections down even further.

There is no doubt that we need a lot more scholarship to understand how written artefacts moved to Europe and the US in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. However, this does not mean that we have to focus on this trajectory exclusively. Based on the Jazzār library as a case study, this chapter suggests that the translocation of books in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries is not predominantly the story of a (proto)colonial book drain, but at least as much one of local book circulation driven by local actors. The main aim of this chapter is, therefore, to show that an a priori fixation on European colonialism and European actors when studying the movements of North African and Western Asian artefacts in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries carries the danger of marginalising the deeds and life stories of individuals who lived through this period. As shown in other cases, these actors disposed of substantial agency in determining where books moved—irrespective of whether we see them as heroes saving cultural heritage or as villains appropriating endowment books.[15]

Most of the seventy-eight al-Jazzār books known are today in regional libraries in Acre, Nablus, Jerusalem, Damascus, Beirut and so on. Numerous institutions and individuals in southern Greater Syria, especially in Palestine, took a great interest in collecting al-Jazzār books after they left the library in Acre. This chapter uses the neutral term of 'translocation' (rather than theft, plunder, decline, drain and so forth) in recognition of the multiple trajectories of the books that were once part of the Jazzār library—and, thus, also the multitude of contexts in which these movements took place.

14 El Shamsy, *Rediscovering the Islamic Classics*.

15 Erbay/Hirschler, "Middle Eastern Agency".

2 Acre and the Reconfiguration of Late Ottoman Libraries

The present-day library of the Jazzār endowment in Acre is the obvious starting point to mount a search for al-Jazzār books. Yet, the number of handwritten books in this library today is very small, well below one hundred, and the vast majority of these books have no link with the historical Jazzār library at all. Only fourteen books in the present-day library can be linked to the historical Jazzār library, each of these original books carrying at least one of the Jazzār provenance elements: the endowment statement, the endowment seal and/or the endowment motto (on these elements, see the *Introduction* to this volume).[16] The other 'new' handwritten books were added to the library at a later point, especially in the early twentieth century. A large corpus of almost twenty new books, for instance, most of them written well after al-Jazzār's death in the course of the nineteenth century, was endowed to the Jazzār library in memory of ʿAlī Mīrī, the former mufti of Acre, by his two sons Rashīd and Aḥmad.[17]

Any statement on the number of original or new al-Jazzār handwritten books in Acre comes with a major methodological caveat as the library's stock has never really stabilised. The holdings of this library have been highly dynamic and, until the present day, the books have not even acquired stable class marks. The volatility of the library is exemplified by the short period of 1983–2022, for which we have three reliable datasets: Maḥmūd ʿAlī ʿAṭā' Allāh published his catalogue of the library mentioned above in 1983; between 2010 and 2012, the British Library *Endangered Archives Project* digitised the library's handwritten books; and in 2021, Samah Hijab conducted an unpublished survey of the holdings.[18] These datasets show that more than two dozen (original and new) handwritten books that ʿAṭā' Allāh had catalogued in 1983 were no longer in the library in 2010.[19] A further seven handwritten books disappeared between 2012, when the British Library concluded its digitisation project, and 2021.[20] Yet, we also have additions, that is, books that do not appear in the 1983 catalogue but are part of the *Endangered Archives Project* between 2010 and 2012,[21] as well as books that appear neither in the 1983 catalogue nor in the *Endangered Archives Project*, but in the 2021 handlist.[22] This is certainly not the end of the story: During the sorting of archival material in the Acre mosque in 2023 within the framework of the Jazzār Mosque endowment board-ALIPH foundation-CSMC Hamburg *Rescuing the Books of al-Jazzār* project, for instance, a handwritten Koran exemplar was found.[23]

We have no similarly comprehensive datasets for the decades prior to 1983, but anecdotal evidence shows that the library's holdings were also highly volatile before this point. Isaac Hasson, for instance, submitted his MA thesis on al-Wāsiṭī's work on the *Merits of Jerusalem* (*Faḍā'il al-Bayt al-Muqaddas*) at the Hebrew University in 1969.[24] He

16 Acre, al-Jazzār Mosque Library, MS 1, MS 2, MS 6, MS 9, MS 21, MS 25, MS 33, MS 34, MS 37, MS 40/1, MS 47 MS 51, MS 64 and MS 67 (ʿAṭā' Allāh, *Fihris ʿAkkā*, 1983).

17 Acre, al-Jazzār Mosque Library, MS 36, MS 43, MS 44, MS 46, MS 48, MS 49, MS 53, MS 59, MS 60, MS 62, MS 63, MS 68, MS 69, MS 71, MS 72, MS 73, MS 76, MS 77 (ʿAṭā' Allāh, *Fihris ʿAkkā*, 1983).

18 We greatly thank Samah Hijab for her generosity in sharing this list with us.

19 Acre, al-Jazzār Mosque Library, MS 9, MS 13, MS 16–20, MS 22–24, MS 26–30, MS 33, MS 35, MS 38, MS 40–42, MS 42, MS 43, MS 50–52, MS 56–58, MS 74 and MS 80 (ʿAṭā' Allāh, *Fihris ʿAkkā*, 1983).

20 Acre, al-Jazzār Mosque Library, MS 8, MS 43–43, MS 59–52, MS 61–63 and MS 68–62 (ʿAṭā' Allāh, *Fihris ʿAkkā*, 1983).

21 Endangered Archives Project, numbers 11, 21 and 28; https://eap.bl.uk/collection/EAP399-1 [accessed 2 January 2023].

22 Handlist Samah Hijab, numbers 56 (Koran) and 57 (*Ijāzat al-Rifāʿī*, a scroll of several metres in length).

23 https://www.csmc.uni-hamburg.de/cultural-heritage/akka.html (accessed 5 March 2024). My thanks go to Maria Luisa Russo (CSMC, Hamburg) for drawing my attention to this find.

24 Al-Wāsiṭī, *Faḍā'il al-Bayt al-Muqaddas*, ed. Hasson.

states in the introduction to his edition of the text that he used the unicum exemplar from the Jazzār library in Acre for this thesis and he thanks his supervisor M.J. Kister for 'putting it under my disposition'.[25] Oral testimony shows that he did, in fact, use images taken in Acre by Yaakov Yehoshua, an official in the Ministry of Religious Affairs, who, in turn, gave a copy of the photostat to M.J. Kister.[26] This photostat is now held in the National Library of Israel.[27] Yet, the actual exemplar must have disappeared from the library in Acre after the photos had been taken: It no longer appears in the 1983 catalogue (nor in the *Endangered Archives Project* or the 2021 handlist).

If we go further back to the early twentieth century, the impression of a highly volatile situation persists. This is exemplified by the grammatical commentary *al-Tadhyīl wa-takmīl* by Abū Ḥayyān (d. 745/1344), #750 in the Jazzār library inventory. Volumes one, three, four and seven of this work are today in Cairo in the National Library carrying al-Jazzār's endowment statement, endowment seal and endowment motto.[28] The fourth volume carries a note dated to 1906 stating that the book was at that point in the mosque of Nazareth from where it was returned to Acre. Thus, we have an object that was originally in Acre in the Jazzār library, was translocated to Nazareth, returned to Acre in 1906 and then translocated to Cairo at some point before 1944.[29]

If we zoom in on the fourteen original handwritten books that belonged to the historical Jazzār library and are in Acre today, we are immediately reminded that the library was also far from stable during al-Jazzār's lifetime. Eight of these books are al-Jazzār inventory books (JIB), that is books that carry (some of the) three provenance elements (endowment statement/seal/motto) and are listed in the 1221/1806 library inventory.[30] Yet, six of the books in Acre are al-Jazzār non-inventory books (JnIB), that is books that carry provenance elements, but are not listed in the 1221/1806 library inventory. These JnIBs probably left the library during the Napoleonic siege of 1799 and were returned at some point after the inventory was written.[31] Even the eight JIBs tell tales of volatility. As they were in the library in 1806 when the inventory was written, and are also in the library today, one might be tempted to see them as unproblematic cases of linear continuity. Yet, their stories are more complex and they clearly need to be included in any discussion of the local trajectories of this library's books: The legal work *Jāmiʿ al-kabīr* by al-Subkī, for instance, appeared in the 1221/1806 library inventory and it is in the library today. However, this book had a spell outside the library, as it carries an early twentieth-century note saying that it was returned (and, thus, re-endowed) to the library after being in private ownership.[32]

25 Al-Wāsiṭī, *Faḍā'il al-Bayt al-Muqaddas*, ed. Hasson, 38.

26 Email by Sam Thrope (National Library of Jerusalem) to Konrad Hirschler, 8 June 2023, on the basis of his conversation with I. Hasson.

27 Shelfmark PH AR 452. Another reproduction of the work is held by the Maʿhad al-makhṭūṭāt al-ʿArabiyya in Cairo (see https://archive.org/details/ahmad_20140615 [accessed 8 January 2024]). These photos were taken in 1932 when the book was taken to Cairo to be photographed in the National Library (Dār al-kutub) (al-Wāsiṭī, *Faḍā'il al-Bayt al-Muqaddas*, ed. Abū al-Mundhir, 7/8).

28 Cairo, Dar al-kutub, 6016h. The fifth volume is in Dublin, Chester Beatty Library, Ar. MS 3342.

29 This title is not recorded in the 1944 inventory of the library: Jerusalem (Abu Dis), The Center for Heritage Revival and Islamic Research, MD/70/33: *Lā'iḥa bi-asmā' al-kutub maʿa ʿadadihā al-mawjūda fī al-maktaba al-Aḥmadiyya al-ʿilmiyya al-Jazzāriyya*, 4 April 1944. I thank Samah Hijab for sharing reproductions of this list.

30 The JIB are: Acre, al-Jazzār Mosque Library, MS 1, MS 2, MS 6, MS 9, MS 34, MS 40/1, MS 51 and MS 64 ('Aṭā' Allāh, *Fihris ʿAkkā*, 1983).

31 The JnIB are: Acre, al-Jazzār Mosque Library, MS 21, MS 25, MS 33, MS 37, MS 47 and MS 67 ('Aṭā' Allāh, *Fihris ʿAkkā*, 1983).

32 Acre, al-Jazzār Mosque Library, MS 2 ('Aṭā' Allāh, *Fihris ʿAkkā*, 1983), fol. 1a:

هذا الكتاب المسمى بالجامع الكبير من الأوقاف الجزارية كما عُلم من ختم الجزار الذي كان على ظهره قبل التجليد وقد أُعيد إلى

The practice of endowing new and re-endowing original al-Jazzār handwritten books to the library in Acre is not only important in terms of methodology to show the volatility and movability of the library's holdings. Much more significantly, it shows that the library's history after the death of al-Jazzār has not just been one of dispersal and decline, but also includes episodes of rebuilding and growth. The most visible episode of this is the early twentieth century when the practice of endowing and re-endowing al-Jazzār handwritten books was particularly intensive. In this period, various actors returned books to their original site and—as seen by the example of Rashīd and Aḥmad, the sons of the mufti of Acre—endowed new handwritten books to the library.

The revival of the Jazzār library in the early twentieth century was part of the wider reconfiguration of libraries in West Asia and North Africa from the late nineteenth century onwards. This reconfiguration in Greater Syria included the foundation of the new Ottoman Public Library (*al-maktaba al-ʿumūmīya*) in Damascus in the 1880s, in which the books of all the 'old' endowment libraries of the city were, henceforth, to be housed.[33] The transformation of the Khalidi family libraries in Jerusalem into one public family library in the following years was part of the same process. The Supreme Muslim Council continued this process in Mandate Palestine in the 1920s by founding the Aqṣā library on the Ḥaram al-sharīf (Temple Mount) in Jerusalem in 1922. Shortly afterwards, it opened the Islamic Library in Jaffa in 1923. The ʿUmarī Mosque library in Gaza was also substantially enlarged with ʿUthmān al-Ṭabbāʿ (d. 1950/1) playing a central role in this process.[34] These new (or renewed) libraries not only preserved handwritten books, but also made printed books available, often including those in European languages as part of a new 'Arabic textual economy,' where print technology furthered new modes of textual production and dissemination.[35]

The history of the late Ottoman reconfiguration of libraries in Greater Syria still needs to be written, but it is clear that it was a development driven by regional and local actors on the ground. Ṭāhir al-Jazā'irī (1852–1920), a driving force in the late Ottoman reconfiguration of libraries throughout Greater Syria,[36] belonged most famously to these regional actors, and also individuals such as ʿUthmān al-Ṭabbāʿ in Gaza. Individuals who are undeservedly much less well-known to date, such as Muḥammad al-Ḥabbāl from Beirut (fl. 1320/1902), were also among these actors. We see from extant printed and handwritten books that al-Ḥabbāl was engaged in a wide variety of activities linked to writerly culture, including copying books[37] and commissioning handwritten books.[38] He wrote for newspapers, such as *al-Ittiḥād al-ʿUthmānī*[39] and the weekly *Thamarāt al-funūn*, founded in Beirut in 1875,[40] and also used the newspaper's network to distribute a print edition that he commissioned in 1902.[41] Most importantly for our purposes, he catalogued the handwritten books in the Khalidi Library of Jerusalem and published its first printed catalogue in 1900.[42] Al-Ḥabbāl was closely connected with Ṭāhir al-Jazā'irī: They worked together in the Khalidi Library and al-Jazā'irī was the editor of the book that al-Ḥabbāl commissioned in 1902.

محله مكتبة المدرسة الأحمدية الجزارية بواسطة صاحب الفضل والفضيلة فضيلتلو الشيخ يوسف أفندي النبهاني وكان استحصاله من يد الحاج محمد يحيى العرابي.

33 Hirschler, *Monument*, 64–67.

34 Al-Mubayyaḍ/Kullāb, *Maktabat*.

35 Wallach, *City in Fragments*, 46.

36 On him, see El Shamsy, *Rediscovering the Islamic Classics*, 158–170.

37 Damascus, National al-Asad Library, MS 5580, 5644 and 8144.

38 Damascus, National al-Asad Library, MS 5615.

39 See, for instance, his note on Acre, al-Jazzār Mosque Library, MS 4 (ʿAṭāʾ Allāh, *Fihris ʿAkkā*, 1983), fol. 1ª where he describes himself as *'wakīl jarīdat al-Ittiḥād al-ʿUthmānī'*.

40 Ṭarrāzī, *Tārīkh al-ṣaḥāfa al-ʿarabīya*, 25.

41 Ibn al-Zubayr al-Aswānī, *Umnīyat al-almaʿī*.

42 Al-Ḥabbāl, *Barnāmaj al-Maktaba al-khālidiyya al-ʿumūmiyya*.

The close connection between this wider reconfiguration of libraries in Greater Syria and the revival of the Jazzār library in Acre is primarily evident from notes on the books. We see the same protagonists appearing in handwritten books still in Acre, such as Ṭāhir al-Jazā'irī, who endowed a new handwritten book to the Jazzār library and presented himself in the endowment note as responsible for the 'libraries of Syria'.[43] He mentions in his personal notebooks that he saw books endowed by al-Jazzār when he was in Acre in 1316/1898.[44] Al-Ḥabbāl was also among those contributing to rebuilding the Jazzār library, and we read on one of the title pages of a Jazzār manuscript: 'It was returned to its place in the library of the Aḥmadiyya Madrasa [al-Jazzār library] by the littérateur Muḥammad Efendi b. Maḥmūd al-Ḥabbāl, correspondent of the *Ottoman Unity* [*al-Ittiḥād al-ʿUthmānī*] newspaper.'[45] On the grammatical commentary mentioned above, now in Cairo, he states: 'For several years I have been aware of this fourth volume (and the seventh volume, too) of the *Tashīl* [...] I returned these two volumes from the Mosque of Nazareth to their place [in Acre]. [...] The writer of these words is Muḥammad b. Maḥmūd al-Ḥabbāl, inhabitant of Beirut.'[46]

Another regional actor who participated in the revival of the Jazzār library and is evident from the notes in the books was the late Ottoman Palestinian scholar Yūsuf al-Nabhānī (1849–1832). He was born in the village of Ijzim (near Haifa, some forty kilometres from Acre). After an education in Cairo at al-Azhar, he settled in Acre in 1872 to teach in the town, probably in al-Jazzār's *madrasa*. In 1876 he moved to Istanbul where he edited a newspaper and subsequently had a short stint as a judge in Mosul in northern Iraq. From 1883, he held positions in the judiciary across Greater Syria, most notably in Beirut for some twenty years.[47] Notes in Acre show that he re-endowed books of the original Jazzār library, probably in the early twentieth century.[48] He declared, for instance, on the title page of volume three of the *Jamʿ al-jawāmiʿ* by al-Subkī: 'This book is part of the Jazzār endowment as is evident from al-Jazzār's seal that was on the back before it was bound. It was returned to the library of al-Jazzār's Aḥmadiyya Madrasa by the honourable Shaykh Yūsuf Efendi al-Nabhānī. It was retrieved from the hands of al-Ḥājj Muḥammad Yaḥyā al-ʿUrābī.'[49] I have not been able to identify al-ʿUrābī, but we do, at least, know that he bought another handwritten book that is in Acre in 1291/1874[50] and that in 1301/1883–1884, he copied a book that is today held in Damascus.[51]

Individuals such as al-Jazā'irī, al-Ḥabbāl and al-Nabhānī are the very same actors who were instrumental in changing the landscape of books and libraries in Greater Syria, including Acre. These in-

43 Acre, al-Jazzār Mosque Library, MS 55 ('Aṭā' Allāh, *Fihris ʿAkkā*, 1983)/EAP 5, fol. 1[a] (JnIB).

44 Al-Jazā'irī, *Tadhkira*, fol. 4[b].

45 Acre, al-Jazzār Mosque Library, MS 4 ('Aṭā' Allāh, *Fihris ʿAkkā*, 1983)/EAP 50, fol. 1[a] (JnIB):

أعيد لمقره مكتبة المدرسة الأحمدية بواسطة الاديب الكامل محمد أفندي بن محمود الحبال وكيل جريدة الاتحاد العثماني.

46 Cairo, Dar al-kutub, 6016h (= #750). Al-Ḥabbāl's note is dated 1324/1906.

47 See his biography in the introduction to al-Nabhanī, *al-Sharaf al-muʾabbad*.

48 The suggested date is based on the dated endowment deed (1323/1906) on a printed book that al-Nabhānī endowed to the Jazzār library. I thank Samah Hijab for sharing this information.

49 Acre, al-Jazzār Mosque Library, MS 1 ('Aṭā' Allāh, *Fihris ʿAkkā*, 1983), fol. 1[a]:

هذا الكتاب من أوقاف الجزار كما عُلم من ختم الجزار الذي كان على ظهره قبل التجليد وقد أرجع أعيدا إلى محله مكتبة المدرسة الأحمدية الجزارية بواسطة الفاضل فضيلتلو الشيخ يوسف أفندي النبهاني وكان استحصاله من يد الحاج محمد يحيى العرابي.

A similar note is on Acre, al-Jazzār Mosque Library, MS 2 ('Aṭā' Allāh, *Fihris ʿAkkā*, 1983), fol. 1[a].

50 Acre, al-Jazzār Mosque Library, MS 4 ('Aṭā' Allāh, *Fihris ʿAkkā*, 1983)/EAP 50, fol. 256[b].

51 Damascus, Maktabat al-Majmaʿ al-ʿilmī, MS 811. I thank Boris Liebrenz for sharing this information with me.

dividuals were deeply committed to safeguarding written heritage, but we do not know how exactly they got hold of the books that they (re)endowed. We know, at least, that at some points, the re-endowment of original al-Jazzār books went hand in hand with rebinding them, as we see from the Jazzār books held in Acre, such as the *Mukhtaṣar tanbīh al-anām*.[52]

The notes left on handwritten books not only show to what extent the revival of the Acre library was embedded in the wider late Ottoman reconfiguration of books and libraries, they also show the contribution of decisively local actors to this process. The central local figure in this regard was ʿAbd Allāh al-Jazzār (1855–1939), no descendant of the library's founder, who was the teacher in the Jazzār *madrasa*, imam of the mosque and judge of Acre.[53] ʿAbd Allāh al-Jazzār has received hardly any attention in scholarship to date, but clearly deserves to be put on the map. He was born and schooled in Acre, from where he went to Cairo to study at al-Azhar. Upon his return to Acre, he became the teacher in the Jazzār *madrasa*, the imam of the mosque, the mufti of the town and finally its judge.[54] Under his leadership, the *madrasa* experienced an important upsurge that went hand in hand with that of the library. This link between him and the revival of the library is evident from the new library seal that some of the Jazzār books carry. This new seal is dated 1323/1905–1906 and proudly describes the library as a 'renewed' library: 'Endowment of the renewed Aḥmadiyya Madrasa library in the mosque of al-Jazzār Pāshā'.[55] Notes ascribe the foundation of this new library unequivocally to ʿAbd Allāh al-Jazzār: 'I endow [...] this book to the library of Aḥmad Pasha al-Jazzār in Akka [Acre], which was renewed and rebuilt by his honour the mufti ʿAbd Allāh Efendi al-Jazzār [...]'.[56]

In addition to ʿAbd Allāh al-Jazzār, we find other local actors, such as the two sons of ʿAlī Mīrī mentioned previously, who added almost twenty new handwritten books to the library. A certain Ḥasan Saʿīd al-Qawwās al-Ṣaydāwī identifies himself as a primary school teacher in Acre and he endowed a new handwritten book to the Jazzār library in 1323/1905.[57] These local actors are often difficult to identify, but it is possible to discern a systematic effort by these late Ottoman library builders to retrieve endowed handwritten books from private ownership. We, thus, find a certain Rafīq ʿAbd al-Malik contributing to this process in a note on an original al-Jazzār book where an owner states: 'I gave this book to Shaykh Muḥammad Rafīq ʿAbd al-Malik al-Shaʿbī [?] so that he returns it to al-

52 Acre, al-Jazzār Mosque Library, MS 67 (ʿAṭāʾ Allāh, *Fihris ʿAkkā*, 1983), fol. 1[a]:

هذا كتاب وقف جزار باشا كما عُلم من ختمه الذي كان على ورقة قد أُعدمت من تجديد تجـ[ـليده] وقد أُعيد بالشراء إلى هذه المكتبة

53 Muḥaybish, "Mujammaʿ al-Jazzār al-khayrī fī ʿAkkā".

54 This information is based on contemporaneous newspaper articles, especially Kurd ʿAlī, "Baḍʿat ayyām fī al-Jalīl (1912)"; Yūsuf Ḥasan, "al-Madrasa al-Aḥmadiyya fī ʿAkkā (1943)"; in addition to Mannāʿ, *Aʿlām Filasṭīn*, 83.

55 Acre, al-Jazzār Mosque Library, MS 1, fol. 1[a] and 239[b]:

وقف مكتبة المدرسة الأحمدية في جامع أحمد باشا الجزار في عكا المجددة سنة 1323.

The same seal is also on Acre, al-Jazzār Mosque Library, MS 2, MS 21, MS 34 and MS 67.

56 Acre, al-Jazzār Mosque Library, MS 39 (ʿAṭāʾ Allāh, *Fihris ʿAkkā*, 1983)/EAP 7, fol. 1[a]:

وقفت وحبست لله تعالى هذا الكتاب على أن يكون مقره مكتبة أحمد باشا [الجـ[ـزار بعكا المجدد إنشاؤها من قبل فضيلة مفتيها الحاج الفاضل الشيخ عبد الله أفندي الجزار ...

57 Acre, al-Jazzār Mosque Library, MS 39 (ʿAṭāʾ Allāh, *Fihris ʿAkkā*, 1983)/EAP 7, fol. 1[a]:

وقفت وحبست لله تعالى هذا الكتاب على أن يكون مقره مكتبة أحمد باشا [الجـ[ـزار بعكا المجدد إنشاؤها من قبل فضيلة مفتيها الحاج الفاضل الشيخ عبد الله أفندي الجزار شرطت أن لا يخرج منها بوجه من الوجوه تحريرا في 4 ذي القعدة سنة 1323 الفقير معلم مكتب عكا حسن سعيد القواس الصيداوي.

Jazzār's library in the Jazzār Mosque in Acre in the year 1324/1906.'[58] We also see a certain 'Abd al-Wāḥid al-Khaṭīb from Haifa[59] and probably 'Afīfa, an otherwise unknown woman,[60] adding to the library stock. In other cases, the actors remain entirely anonymous: 'This book is an endowment of al-Jazzār Pasha, as is evident from al-Jazzār's seal on a page that was lost because of its rebinding. It was returned to this library by purchase.'[61]

The revival of the Jazzār library in the early twentieth century was not limited to re-endowing original handwritten books or adding new ones, the library was also enlarged by numerous printed books. These printed books are still in the Jazzār library today and constitute an important insight into intellectual life in late Ottoman Palestine. They have not yet been studied in depth, but Samah Hijab has taken a first step by examining them with a focus on the endowment notes. The large number of these notes shows wonderfully the extent to which local actors also drove the expansion of the library's print collection. The vast majority of the notes date to the first decade of the twentieth century, when the development of the library gained pace. Here, we see dozens of notables of early twentieth-century Acre who endowed printed books to the library, including scholars, administrators, judges, officials and officers. In addition, individuals from nearby towns and villages, such as Haifa, Ṣafad, Umm al-Faḥm and Samakh (close to Tiberias), also actively contributed to the build-up of the library. Among those endowing printed books are also those who re-endowed original handwritten books or endowed new ones, such as Rashīd and Aḥmad, Ṭāhir al-Jazā'irī and Yūsuf al-Nabhānī.[62]

An inventory of the Jazzār library from 1927 shows the success of the library-building process as it held an impressive 1,200 printed books at that point. The number of handwritten books is, by contrast, astonishingly low, a mere fifty, and this might represent only part of the collection.[63] Another inventory from 1944, discussed below, gives the number of 148 for handwritten books in the Jazzār library, and this indicates that we are clearly looking at a very low number of handwritten books in the Jazzār library in the first half of the twentieth century. That we have somewhere between 50 and 150 handwritten books in the library after so many of them had been re-endowed and so many new ones had been added means that the Jazzār library must have been practically devoid of any handwritten books in the late nineteenth century.

The revival of the Jazzār library in the late Ottoman period within the framework of the relaunch of the *madrasa* was, thus, clearly a success, and late Ottoman library builders, such as 'Abd Allāh al-Jazzār, put this library back on the cultural map of Palestine. Amīn al-Rayḥānī (1876–1940), for instance, published his Arab nationalist Syrian history in 1928, in which al-Jazzār is framed as a non-Arab tyrant. Al-Rayḥānī, therefore, had nothing positive to say about al-Jazzār except 'one good deed of which I saw the traces

58 Acre, al-Jazzār Mosque Library, MS 40/1 ('Aṭā' Allāh, *Fihris 'Akkā*, 1983), fol. 1a.

59 Acre, al-Jazzār Mosque Library, MS 32 ('Aṭā' Allāh, *Fihris 'Akkā*, 1983)/EAP 49, fol. 1a.

60 Acre, al-Jazzār Mosque Library, MS 78 ('Aṭā' Allāh, *Fihris 'Akkā*, 1983)/EAP 20, fol. 1a ('Afīfa bt. 'Alī Pasha). Though in her case the Jazzār library is not explicitly named as the place of endowment.

61 Acre, al-Jazzār Mosque Library, MS 67 ('Aṭā' Allāh, *Fihris 'Akkā*, 1983), fol. 1a:

هذا كتاب وقف جزار باشا كما عُلم من ختمه الذي كان على ورقة قد أُعدمت من تجديد تجـ[ليده] وقد أُعيد بالشراء إلى هذه المكتبة

Other anonymous endowers appear on Acre, al-Jazzār Mosque Library, MS 12, MS 21, MS 41 and MS 79 ('Aṭā' Allāh, *Fihris 'Akkā*, 1983).

62 Rashīd and Aḥmad in 1324/1906–1907, al-Jazā'irī in 1323/1906 and al-Nabhānī in 1323/1906. I thank Samah Hijab for sharing this information.

63 Jerusalem (Abu Dis), The Center for Heritage Revival and Islamic Research, T-MS/2–230/325: *Bayyān asmā' al-kutub al-mawjūda bi-al-Maktaba al-Aḥmadīya*, 17 January 1927.

when I visited the Jazzār Mosque in Acre. In it is a library with books, most of them handwritten.'[64] Considering the massive influx of printed books, al-Rayḥānī's statement that the majority of books in the library in the 1920s were handwritten is highly unlikely. However, the library must have made quite an impression on him to grudgingly concede that this tyrant has, at least, one good deed to his name. The library must have stayed in good shape well into the 1930s when Johannes Pohl included the library in his overview article on the libraries of Palestine, stating that it 'encompasses c. 1,000 volumes, mostly Arabic manuscripts and books'.[65]

The library continued to function well into the 1940s. ʿAbd Allāh Mukhliṣ, for instance, the scholar and former director of the Supreme Muslim Council's General Endowment Administration (*Idārat al-Awqāf al-ʿĀmma*), borrowed three handwritten books from the Jazzār library to publish them in articles in 1946 and 1947 (#977, #982 and #1241 in the Jazzār library inventory).[66] Documents kept today in Jerusalem (Abu Dis) at *The Center for Heritage Revival and Islamic Research* show a substantial amount of paperwork produced by the General Endowment Administration, ʿAbd Allāh Mukhliṣ and the (anonymous) librarian of the Jazzār library on the return of these three books to the library in 1944.[67] The discussions around the three books were part of a wider interest of the General Endowment Administration in the affairs of the library and the interest of a local *Committee of the Aḥmadiyya Library in Acre* that was founded in 1943 by local notables.[68] The General Endowment Administration particularly demanded that the Jazzār librarian carried out a full revision of the library's stock, including information on any books currently on loan. The librarian did indeed produce a list that provides a wonderful snapshot of the state of the library in 1944 with 1,377 printed books and 148 handwritten books.[69]

The three ʿAbd Allāh Mukhliṣ books must have been extracted from the library at some point after 1944, as they are not listed in ʿAṭāʾ Allāh's 1983 catalogue. On account of such losses, the library's importance waned, and it started to fade from the map of well-known Palestinian libraries. Ṭarrāzī's survey of Arabic libraries published in the late 1940s/early 1950s, for instance, has a section specifically dedicated to Palestinian libraries. While the Aqṣā Mosque library and the Khalidi Library are discussed, the Acre library is absent.[70] When al-Munajjid published his work on Arabic handwritten books in Palestine in 1982 he lists some fifteen libraries, but again the Jazzār library is not among them.[71]

This overview of the development of the Jazzār library has shown that we are looking at a gradual and long-term process during which books left the library over the course of the nineteenth century. This process did not start before the 1820s, as indicated by the Abū Nabbūt library, and the library must have been practically devoid of handwritten books by the late nineteenth century. While we have some books that allow us to see individual trajectories, we do not yet have the data to really see the larger picture of how this library was dismantled. By contrast, there is ample evidence to trace the revival of the library and influx of

64 Al-Rayḥānī, *al-Nakabāt*, 100. See also Chapter 4 by Feras Krimsti in this volume on al-Rayḥānī.

65 Pohl, *Bibliotheken Palästinas*, 52.

66 Mukhliṣ, "Majmūʿat ashʿār" (= #1241), Mukhliṣ, "Kitāb Rawḍat al-faṣāḥa" (= #977) and Mukhliṣ, "Kitāb Taḥrīr al-taḥbīr" (= #982).

67 Jerusalem (Abu Dis), The Center for Heritage Revival and Islamic Research, MD/70/33: Letter by ʿAbd Allāh Mukhliṣ to the General Endowment Administration in Jerusalem, 1 July 1944, and letter by the Endowment Administration in Jerusalem to ʿAbd Allāh Mukhliṣ, 13 October 1944. I thank Samah Hijab for sharing reproductions of these letters.

68 On this committee see Muḥaybish, *al-Madrasa al-Aḥmadīya*, 174–175.

69 Jerusalem (Abu Dis), The Center for Heritage Revival and Islamic Research, MD/70/33: *Lāʾiḥa bi-asmaʾ al-kutub maʿa ʿadadihā al-mawjūda fī al-maktaba al-Aḥmadiyya al-ʿilmiyya al-Jazzāriyya*, 4 April 1944.

70 Ṭarrāzī, *Khazāʾin al-kutub al-ʿArabiyya*, I, 141–143.

71 Al-Munajjid, *al-Makhṭūṭāt al-ʿArabiyya fī Filasṭīn*.

handwritten books in the early twentieth century. The 'post-revival' period from the 1940s onwards is again rather difficult to describe in conceptual terms. Handwritten books were clearly extracted until very recently, but we have insufficient data to understand the nuts and bolts of this process. The immediate impact of the violence of 1948 and the foundation of the state of Israel on the collection is, for instance, entirely unclear.

3 Translocation within Southern Greater Syria beyond Acre

Even though the library was practically devoid of handwritten books by the late nineteenth century, the late Ottoman revival of the Acre library was possible because a substantive number of original al-Jazzār books had remained in the region and could, thus, be returned to the library. Individuals such as Yūsuf al-Nabhānī, Rafīq ʿAbd al-Malik, al-Ḥabbāl and ʿAbd Allāh al-Jazzār played a crucial role in preserving the book heritage in Acre and, thereby, contributing to shaping a new library topography in the region. This preservation of al-Jazzār books within this new topography was a much wider phenomenon that is visible in libraries well beyond Acre. A total of twenty-three of the overall corpus of seventy-eight al-Jazzār handwritten books, that is almost thirty per cent, are today in libraries in southern Greater Syria beyond Acre, including Damascus (National Asad Library and al-Majmaʿ al-ʿilmī), Beirut (American University of Beirut, Université Saint-Joseph, Zuhayr al-Shāwīsh), Jerusalem (Khalidi, Isʿāf al-Nashāshībī, 'Abandoned Property' (AP) collections in the National Library of Israel and *The Center for Heritage Revival and Islamic Research*) and Nablus (al-Najah University Library). All of them carry at least one of the Jazzār provenance elements—endowment statement, endowment seal, endowment motto—and/or can be linked to the Jazzār library inventory from 1221/1806.

Many of the books that left Acre went into the region's private libraries. Four of them are today in the Khalidi Library in Jerusalem.[72] In one case, it is evident that this happened before the Khalidi Library became a public library in 1900 and this is probably also true for the other three books. We find the statement at the end of *al-Ishrāf bi-faḍl al-ashrāf* that '[t]he loose pages of this book had become separated in the *dasht* [the section of the library with unbound books and loose papers]. Ḥusayn Ḥusnī b. ʿAlī al-Khālidī assembled them and organised them in their original way in 1309[/1891].'[73] Ḥusayn's name appears in numerous books in the Khalidi Library with such notes typically dated to the years before 1900. He must have played an important role in the years leading up to the transformation of this private library into a public library. Lawrence Conrad argued that 'there was already a nascent institution in place more than a decade earlier [than 1900]',[74] and Ḥusayn arguably played an important role in this nascent institution. Yet, his role as a late Ottoman library builder has not been acknowledged in scholarship so far, in contrast to that of Rāghib al-Khālidī (1858–1951).[75] The fact that Ḥusayn reconstituted and rebound so many handwritten books, among them this Jazzār book, links him closely to his contemporaries, such as al-Nabhānī, who displayed similar rebinding efforts when they revived and renewed the library of Acre.

That al-Jazzār books were translocated from Acre to Palestinian private libraries is also evident from the five handwritten books within the 'AP'

72 Jerusalem, Khalidi Library, MS 73 (JIB), 966 (JIB), 1060 (JnIB) and 1699 (JIB).

73 Jerusalem, Khalidi Library, MS 1699, fol. 146b: (cf. https://w3id.org/vhmml/readingRoom/view/510065) [accessed 3 January 2023]:

جامع أوراق هذا الكتاب بعد شتاتها وتفرقها بين الدشت ومرجعه لأصله كما كان راجي عفو مولاه المنان الفقير حسين حسني ابن المرحوم الحاج علي أفندي الخالدي يرجو من طالع فيه أن يدعو له بالغفران محرم سنة 1309.

74 Conrad, "The Khalidi Library", 198.

75 Conrad, "The Khalidi Library"; Khālidī, *al-Maktaba al-Khālidīya*.

section in the National Library of Israel.[76] Among the library's holdings of Arabic handwritten books, those with an AP class mark constitute a substantial corpus of some 700 books so far. Little research has been done yet on the history of these handwritten artefacts that were appropriated from Palestinian homes in 1948. The printed AP books in the library, by contrast, have garnered some interest and research has started to show what catastrophic consequences dismantling such libraries had on Palestinian cultural life.[77] My comments here are very much indebted to Vincent Engelhardt, who has worked on this collection in preparation for his thesis under the supervision of Samuel Thrope (National Library of Israel) and with support from Lina Jabali. More specifically, the role of Efraim Wust has to be highlighted, as it is he who catalogued the Arabic AP handwritten books, along with the rest of the National Library's Islamic handwritten book collection, including many ownership marks. While Wust's work has not been published, it is accessible in the online cataloguing records of the National Library along with digitised copies of the AP handwritten book collection.[78] This newly completed digitisation is part of the Library's efforts over the past decade to make the AP collection and its history more accessible. Nevertheless, it is still mostly unclear from which Palestinian libraries the AP handwritten books were removed. Hidden beyond the blank AP class marks are stories of book collections owned by individuals, families and institutions that are yet to be uncovered.

Two al-Jazzār books in the AP section do, however, carry a clear indication as to their pre-1948 location and trajectory. Ms. AP Ar. 177 carries not only a defaced endowment seal of al-Jazzār, but also the note that '[i]t entered the ownership of Ḥusayn Ṭāhā al-Dāwūdī on the 15th Ramadan 1290[/1873]'.[79] The Dāwūdīs, or al-Dajānīs, were among the important Palestinian families during the Ottoman period.[80] The family held the role of guardians of the Tomb of the Prophet David in Jerusalem from the early sixteenth century onwards and Ḥusayn underlines in other ownership notes that he holds this position.[81] Ḥusayn was a very active library builder and there are more than fifty handwritten books in the AP section alone that carry his ownership notes from the late nineteenth century.[82] While Ḥusayn died well before 1948, the high number of his books in the AP section makes it very likely that his library was preserved, probably within the family, until it became 'AP'.

Ḥusayn's library was part of a wider topography of al-Dajānī libraries, and the court register of Jerusalem from this period shows the number of books that circulated within various households of that family.[83] The second al-Jazzār book in the AP section carrying an indication as to its pre-1948 location brings us to one other such library within that large family, namely, to the Jaffa branch of the Dijānīs. This book carries not only another defaced al-Jazzār seal, but also an ownership note naming ʿAbd al-Qādir al-Dijānī (1809–1877) with a seal dated to 1268/1851–1852.[84] The AP section in the National Library of Israel has again a large cor-

76 Jerusalem, National Library of Israel, AP Ar. 177 (JIB), AP Ar. 258 (JIB), AP Ar. 261 (JnIB), AP Ar. 290 (JIB) and AP Ar. 410 (JIB).

77 Amit, "*Salvage or Plunder*".

78 https://www.nli.org.il/he/discover/manuscripts/warraq [accessed 29 November 2023]. I thank Samuel Thrope for his advice on this section.

79 Jerusalem, National Library of Israel, AP Ar. 177, fol. 1a.

80 Mannāʿ, "al-Nukhba al-Maqdisiyya".

81 For instance, Jerusalem, National Library of Israel, AP Ar. 185, fol. 1a.

82 I thank Vincent Engelhardt who generously shared this information.

83 See the reproduction of one document in Ghosheh, *Encyclopædia Palestinnica*, XVI, 228 as well as Barakat, *Tārīkh al-maktabāt al-ʿarabīya*, 88.

84 Jerusalem, National Library of Israel, AP Ar. 258, fol. 1a:

هذا الكتاب من من ذي المن دام مَنُّه على الفقير إليه سبحانه السيد عبد القادر أبو رباح الدجاني الحنفي الأحمدي الخلوتي القادري الرفاعي الدسوقي خادم العلم والطريق بمدينة يافا عفى عنه بمنه آمين.

pus of handwritten books by ʿAbd al-Qādir, around fifty, so that his library was also probably preserved within the family until 1948.

The other handwritten books preserved in Palestinian libraries do not carry any notes providing insight into their trajectory between the early nineteenth century and their current location. In the case of the two al-Jazzār handwritten books in al-Najah University Library in Nablus, it is their very presence in this library that indicates a trajectory involving Palestinian family libraries.[85] The library's webpage profiles its holdings of handwritten books as follows: 'The libraries of al-Najah National University hold a large collection of old and important handwritten books. These were collected from the established families of Nablus known for their famous scholars, litterateurs and poets.'[86] There is no conclusive evidence that the Jazzār books in this library have a provenance going back to family libraries. The prominent role of such libraries in the trajectories of the other Palestinian handwritten books previously discussed makes it very likely.

We have two handwritten Jazzār books that are (or were) part of the Jaffa collection.[87] I use the imprecise term 'Jaffa collection' to refer to the books of the Islamic Library (*al-Maktaba al-Islāmiyya*) that the Supreme Muslim Council founded in 1923 in dedicated premises and that included the remnants of the Abū Nabbūt library mentioned previously. The fate of this library after 1948 is unclear, but the presence of bi-scriptural Arabic/Hebrew seals on the books shows that the library continued to exist beyond 1948. When ʿAṭāʾ Allāh wrote the catalogue of this collection in the early 1980s, the Islamic Library had ceased to exist, and what was left of the collection was stored in the town's al-Nuzha Mosque. After ʿAṭāʾ Allāh catalogued the books, they became part of the library of a club called al-Nādī al-Islāmī.[88] We accessed microfilm copies (probably produced by ʿAṭāʾ Allāh himself) of the two al-Jazzār handwritten books that ʿAṭāʾ Allāh catalogued via the Najah University Library website.[89] One of the two books has since moved to *The Center for Heritage Revival and Islamic Research* in Jerusalem (Abu Dis)[90] and we have not been able to verify the whereabouts of the second book. There are no indications as to the trajectories of these books between the writing of the library inventory in 1221/1806 and the foundation of the Islamic Library in Jaffa. The opening of the library in 1923 by the Supreme Muslim Council is described as a civic event in which 'a large number of the town's grandees' participated. This description also stresses that the library was intensively used not only for reading purposes but also for numerous public lectures and other events.[91] It is, thus, possible that the library's stock was built up, at least in part, by donations from the town's family libraries.[92]

When we move beyond modern-day Palestine and Israel to Damascus, the role of family libraries in hosting translocated al-Jazzār books in southern Greater Syria is again visible. Among the five

85 Nablus, al-Najah University Library, NL 211508 and NL 250213 (barcode numbers).

86 https://manuscripts.najah.edu/ [accessed 16 August 2022]:

تحوي مكتبات جامعة النجاح الوطنية مجموعة كبيرة من المخطوطات القديمة الهامة التي تم جمعها من البيوت النابلسية العريقة التي تميزت بعلمائها وادبائها وشعرائها المشهورين [...].

87 ʿAṭāʾ Allāh, *Fihrist Yāfā*, no. 52 (pp. 623): *al-Kashshāf ʿan ḥaqāʾiq al-tanzīl* by al-Zamakhsharī and Ibid., no. 86 (p. 96): *Kitāb Sībawayhi*.

88 Ibid., 34.

89 Ibid., no. 52: https://manuscripts.najah.edu/node/217; Ibid., no. 86: https://manuscripts.najah.edu/node/140 [both accessed 3 January 2023].

90 Jerusalem (Abu Dis), The Center for Heritage Revival and Islamic Research, 301/2 (Afaneh et al., *Fihris makhṭūṭāt Filasṭīn al-muṣawwara*, V, 72; formerly Jaffa, MS 52 (ʿAṭāʾ Allāh, *Fihrist Yāfā*, 1984): al-Zamakhsharī, *al-Kashshāf ʿan ḥaqāʾiq al-tanzīl*).

91 *Bayān al-majlis al-sharʿī al-Islāmī al-aʿlā fī Filasṭīn sanat 1341/2 (1923/4)*, Jerusalem: Maṭbaʿat madrasat al-aytām al-Islāmiyya, 1343/1924, 33.

92 Al-Dajānī, *Madīnat Yāfā*, 258.

handwritten books in Damascus, no. 44 in the Majmaʿ al-ʿilmī Library carries a seal showing that this book entered the ownership of the great Damascene *ḥadīth* scholar Muḥammad Badr al-Dīn al-Ḥasanī (1267/1850–1354/1935).[93] Al-Ḥasanī systematically purchased handwritten books that had been taken out of endowment libraries, such as the eighteenth-century Damascene book endowment by Mollah ʿUthmān al-Kurdī. His stipulation that these books should be returned to the status of endowed books was only implemented many decades after his death in 1975, when his grandson Muḥammad Fakhr al-Dīn al-Ḥasanī endowed some of his books.[94]

The final handwritten book of relevance for this section on southern Greater Syria might seem somewhat surprising at first glance: #1267 in a library inventory that is today in Tokyo in the Daiber collection of the University Library.[95] This collection was bought from Hans Daiber in two batches, one in 1986–1987 and the second in 1994. The Jazzār book #1267 belongs to the second batch and Hans Daiber states that he, in turn, bought this handwritten book in Damascus at some point between the years 1986 and 1992 from a souvenir shop owner called Abū Aḥmad near the Umayyad Mosque.[96] In other words, this book stayed in southern Greater Syria for almost 200 years after al-Jazzār's death and was, until very recently, part of Damascene book culture. Regrettably, the book does not carry any ownership notes that would offer an insight into its trajectory in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries.

In sum, it is evident that almost fifty per cent of the known al-Jazzār books stayed in southern Greater Syria, including Acre (in addition to the manuscript that only recently moved to Tokyo). That these thirty-seven handwritten books remained in the region indicates that the dispersal of the books and their preservation in new libraries was very much driven by local actors who extracted books from and sometimes returned them to the library. Their translocation to other libraries in the region repeatedly also took place with the aim of returning the books to endowed status, even if their new home was not the Jazzār library itself. The extraction of handwritten books from the Jazzār library and their subsequent trajectories was, thus, at least on the basis of the current small corpus, to a large extent, a local story involving local actors.

4 Translocations in West Asia and North Africa beyond Greater Syria

If we now move beyond Greater Syria to consider the trajectories of al-Jazzār books to libraries in the wider West Asian and North African region, one phenomenon, as mentioned above, is particularly striking: the low number of books in Istanbul. There are only three al-Jazzār handwritten books in Istanbul today (bearing at least one of the three Jazzār provenance elements). They are all in the Süleymaniye Library, which has increasingly become the central library of handwritten books in Turkey since the late nineteenth century.[97] The Süleymaniye's system of class marks thankfully preserves the name of the historical library where the book was held before its integration into the Süleymaniye Library. The three al-Jazzār books did not come from one of the grand libraries that had

93 Damascus, Maktabat al-Majmaʿ al-ʿilmī, MS 44, fol. 1ª:

تنفيذا لوصية المحدث الأكبر السيد محمد بدر الدين الحسني أعاد هذا الكتاب إلى الوقف حفيده السيد محمد فخر الدين ابن محمد عصام غفر الله لهم سنة 1395 هـ

We have not been able to access three other Damascene handwritten books in the National al-Asad Library (MS 44, 219 and 11144).

94 Aljoumani, "Tārīkh maktabat al-Mullā ʿUthmān al-Kurdī", 244–247.

95 Tokyo, University Library, Daiber Collection II, 76.

96 Email Hans Daiber to Konrad Hirschler, 25 January 2023.

97 Istanbul, Süleymaniye Library, Yazma Bağışlar 766, Pertevniyal V. Sultan 759 and Kemankes 21.

been established in Istanbul in the previous centuries, such as the Ayasofya (Hagia Sofia) or Fatih libraries. Instead, one of them came into the Süleymaniye Library via a library that was established in the course of the later nineteenth century, Pertevniyal Valide Sultan. Another book is in the residual 'Donations' class mark (Yazma Bağışlar), which was set up after the Süleymaniye started to function as a de facto central library of handwritten books.

Cairo, with nine handwritten books, is more important than Istanbul as a destination of al-Jazzār books. As mentioned in the *Introduction* to this volume, the actual number of al-Jazzār books in Cairo is most certainly significantly higher because the holdings of the National Library, the largest collection of handwritten books in the Arabic world, could not be systematically searched within the framework of the Jazzār Library Project. Private libraries of the late nineteenth and early twentieth century that were subsequently integrated into the National Library would be prime locations to search for al-Jazzār handwritten books in the future. Aḥmad Pasha Taymūr (1871–1930), for instance, had over 8,000 handwritten books in his library, parts of which he acquired in Damascus where he was a member of the Arabic Academy of Sciences.[98] One of the two known al-Jazzār books in the National Library is indeed from the Taymūr subcollection (carrying al-Jazzār's endowment statement, seal and motto), thus, indicating that the role of private collectors went beyond Greater Syria.[99] Four other books are in the second largest library in Cairo, al-Azhar Library (all carrying at least the Jazzār endowment motto).[100] The higher number compared to the National Library is probably only due to the fact that al-Azhar is a much more welcoming place for researchers and the Jazzār books are, thus, easier to identify. One of these handwritten books, #1166 in the Jazzār library inventory, was in the private library of the Egyptian legal scholar Ḥasan Jalāl al-Ḥusaynī (1271/1855–1336/1918) who bequeathed his books to al-Azhar Library.[101]

Three further handwritten books in Cairo are held in the Central Library of Islamic Manuscripts of the Egyptian Ministry of Endowments.[102] From the early 2000s, this library has brought together handwritten books that had been previously held in endowed mosques such as Masjid al-imām Ḥusayn and Masjid al-Sayyida Zaynab.[103] Regrettably, the new class marks in the Central Library do not provide any insights into the books' previous library. However, there are traces on the books themselves that offer an insight into their place prior to their present-day location. One of the Central Library's handwritten books is entitled *Waqf al-Malik al-Ashraf*, referring to the massive endowments of the Mamluk Sultan al-Malik al-Ashraf Barsbay (d. 841/1438). At first glance, it seems self-evident that the medieval text of a Cairene endowment deed is in the Ministry of Endowments in Cairo today. Yet, this is de facto a JIB that was in Acre in 1806 bearing an [effaced] endowment seal and the motto. There is no indication when this codex was written and how al-Jazzār got hold of it (or perhaps even had it produced for his library?). This codex is the summary version of a larger manuscript that is, in turn, kept in the Ministry of Endowments' archive with the number 880. This larger 'original' deed conserves the texts of the endowment deeds in more detail and has probably been in Cairo continuously since it was first produced.[104] The summary *Waqf al-Malik al-Ashraf* came into the holdings of the Ministry

98 Sayyid, *Dār al-kutub al-miṣrīya*, 74–76.

99 Cairo, Dar al-kutub, Taymūr, Muṣṭalaḥ al-ḥadīth 97.

100 Cairo, al-Azhar Library, MS 22783, MS 83318, MS 85307 and MS 91135.

101 Cairo, al-Azhar Library, MS 22783. On him, see the biography in *al-Manār* 10/20 (1918): 441–444.

102 Cairo, Ministry of Islamic Endowments Library, MS 3018, MS 2398/209 and MS 4490.

103 According to the memorial plate on the building, the Central Library was opened 26 June 2004.

104 Darrāj, *L'Acte de waqf de Barsbay*. Darrāj bases his edition on the codex Cairo, Dār al-kutub, *ta'rīkh* 3390 that has the same text as that in the Jazzār/Ministry of endowment manuscript.

of Endowments from 'Maktabat Ḥusayn', probably the library of the Ḥusayn Mosque in Cairo close to al-Azhar.[105]

Another Central Library book, no. 4490, that had been part of the Jazzār library (bearing the endowment seal, statement and motto) brings us back to the importance of family libraries and the complicated post-al-Jazzār endowment trajectories of many books. Before coming to the Cairo ministry, this book had been part of the library of the Directorate of Alexandrian Endowments (*Mudīrīyat al-Awqāf al-Iskandarīya*) and had moved there from the library of the Mursī Abū al-ʿAbbās Mosque in Alexandria. The book endowment in the Mursī Abū al-ʿAbbās Mosque, in turn, goes back to a merger of Alexandrian family libraries in 1903. Our al-Jazzār book must have become part of one of these family libraries in the course of the nineteenth century.[106] The third Central Library book with a Jazzār provenance, no. 3018 (bearing the endowment seal), came into the ministry from the library in the Dardīr Mosque/Mausoleum in Cairo, which goes back to the Cairene scholar Aḥmad al-Dardīr (d. 1201/1786).[107]

The importance of family libraries in the trajectories of al-Jazzār books is also evident from entry #1187 that is today in Riyadh, Imam Muhammad Ibn Saud Islamic University, MS 1094. This JIB became part of the library of Aḥmad Khayrī Bey (1907–1967) in the Buḥayra Governate in Lower Egypt. This library was constituted as an endowment and seemingly contained some 16,000 volumes of printed or manuscript books by 1960. Despite the founder's intentions, the library was sold after his death via the book trader Muḥammad b. Aḥmad Ṣādiq to the Cairene publisher and book trader Raʾūf Nuʿmān, who, in turn, sold most of the books to the Imam Muhammad Ibn Saud Islamic University in Riyadh. At least, the books retained an independent identity in this collection and are labelled as going back to the 'Maktabat Aḥmad Khayrī'.[108]

Two handwritten books are today in Qatar in the National Library and they are the only al-Jazzār artefacts that have a clear trajectory beyond Arabic/Muslim contexts. They are a medical work[109] (carrying the endowment seal, the [effaced] motto and the statement) and an Arab translation (via Pahlavi) of Kassiano's Greek work on agriculture (carrying seal, statement and motto).[110] While neither book carries any subsequent ownership notes that would have indicated their post-al-Jazzār library trajectory, they carry very rich paracontent referring to the text as well as guest content.[111] The agricultural work has scribbles, lines and numerous other doodles on virtually every page, including some animals. These are all drawn in pencil and do not reveal anything about the identity of the former owner. The owner of the medical work—probably the same person—engaged in the margins in an equally vivid manner with the text of the book. However, in the case of this book, we find numerous commentaries, notes and *nota bene* marks in addition to the doodles (which include a human being, a flower and many crowns).[112] These marginalia are written in Western Armenian, suggesting that this al-Jazzār book had found a private owner (perhaps in Jerusalem) well beyond the Muslim community, who also adorned the margins with a cross. The fact that these two books have a

105 Cairo, Ministry of Islamic Endowments Library, MS 209/2398 (#1372 in the Jazzār library inventory). Zaydān, *Tārīkh ādāb al-lugha al-ʿarabīya*, IV, 123.

106 Cairo, Ministry of Islamic Endowments Library, MS 4490.

107 Cairo, Ministry of Islamic Endowments Library, MS 3018. On this library see Zaydān, *Tārīkh ādāb al-lugha al-ʿarabīya*, IV, 118.

108 Ḥamāda, *ʿĀshiq al-kutub*.

109 Doha, Qatar National Library HC.MS.00211 (#1431 in the Jazzār library inventory).

110 Doha, Qatar National Library QNL00017150. On Kassiano's work see Ullmann, *Natur- und Geheimwissenschaften im Islam*, 434–435.

111 For paracontent and guest content cf. Ciotti et al., *Definition of Paracontent*.

112 I thank Meliné Pehlivanian (Staatsbibliothek Berlin) for generously sharing her readings of the marginalia with me.

shared trajectory towards Qatar, both are thematically not linked to Islamic fields of knowledge and they share similar vivid marginalia makes it very likely that they were both in the possession of the same Armenian-writing owner.

In total, there are, thus, nineteen handwritten books, twenty-four per cent, in the libraries of Western Asia and North Africa beyond southern Greater Syria.[113] They indicate again that the translocation of al-Jazzār books is not so much a phenomenon that has to be understood with reference to the Ottoman centre or European (proto)colonial intrusion. Rather, it was a gradual and multifaceted process that involved a large number of mostly nineteenth-century local and regional individuals and their private libraries.

5 Translocations to Europe and the US

A number of twenty-two al-Jazzār books in European and US-American libraries, twenty-eight per cent, is significant. Yet, this is clearly not a large enough number to see the translocation of books to Europe and the US as the main factor in the demise of the Jazzār library. In addition, even in the case of these departures to Europe and the US, we repeatedly see the role of local actors who first extracted these books from the Jazzār library in the course of the nineteenth century. This is particularly evident in those cases where the books had been in local private libraries after they left the Jazzār library and before they went into the ownership of European or US-American libraries. This is, for instance, the case for the only al-Jazzār handwritten book in Leipzig (carrying the Jazzār seal), which was formerly part of the Rifāʿiyya library.[114] The Rifāʿiyya was a Damascene private library sold in 1853 via the Prussian consul Johann Gottfried Wetzstein (1815–1905). The owner of this private library was, as Boris Liebrenz has argued, ʿUmar al-Ḥarīrī al-Rifāʿī, a leading member of the Rifāʿiyya order.[115] Yet, even al-Rifāʿī was not the first owner of the book after its extraction from the Jazzār library. Rather, prior to its incorporation into the Rifāʿiyya library, the book had already been in the ownership of another Damascene book owner, a chancery secretary named Muṣṭafā b. Muḥammad Saʿīd Efendī al-Būsnawī.[116]

The role of consuls in translocating al-Jazzār books to Europe goes well beyond Wetzstein. The three books that are today in the British Library (they all carry the Jazzār seal and endowment motto) originate from the same milieu. Two of them were sold to the library in 1872 by the scholar and consul Auguste de Jaba (1801–1894) as is evident from the books' final flyleaves. De Jaba lived in Erzurum as the Russian consul from 1848 to 1866 and subsequently in Smyrna/Izmir.[117] The third book, #221 in the Jazzār library inventory, was sold to the British Library in 1893 by the art and book dealer Joseph-Ange Durighello (1863–1924), the son of the French vice-consul in Sidon.[118] The

113 To this number belong the books Mecca, al-Ḥaram al-Makkī Library, MS 1499 and Riyadh, King Faisal Center for Research and Islamic Studies, MS 100, that do not carry indications on their post-al-Jazzār trajectory, as well as the book Shinqit (Mauritania), Collection of Ahl Ḥabat, MS 9/96 (according to Baffioni, *Catalogue des Manuscrits*, 227) for which we were not able to access reproductions.

114 Universitätsbibliothek Leipzig, Vollers 118: https://www.refaiya.uni-leipzig.de/receive/DE15Book_manuscript_00015338 [accessed 3 January 2023].

115 Liebrenz, *Rifāʿiya aus Damaskus*.

116 Universitätsbibliothek Leipzig, Vollers 118, fol. 1^{v}, ed. Boris Liebrenz: https://www.refaiya.uni-leipzig.de/receive/DE15SecEntry_secentry_00000604 see also https://www.refaiya.uni-leipzig.de/receive/MyMss Person_agent_00005532 [both accessed 3 January 2023].

117 London, British Library, Or. 1183 and Or. 1206. My thanks go to Daniel Lowe (British Library) for providing crucial support on this matter. On de Jaba, see Conermann/Kemper, *Soviet Oriental Studies*, 87–88.

118 London, British Library, Or. 4706. British Library Corporate Archives, BLCA/S81/02 (British Museum, Department of Oriental Printed Books and Manuscripts, Registers of Oriental Manuscripts, Or.3481–Or.90340, 1887–1921) and BLCA/S74/01 (British Museum, Department of

FIGURE 7.1 al-Surūrī, *Sharḥ Gulistān*, Antiquariat Inlibris, Vienna ('Paris book', see *Introduction* to this volume)

case of the 'Paris book' that was offered up for sale in June 2023 (#1561 or #1562 in the Jazzār library inventory) is strikingly similar. Its last identifiable owner, the French scholar Frédéric Macler, had received it from the French consul of Damascus, Paul Savoye, in 1901.[119] In contrast to the Wetzstein case, there is no indication where and when De Jaba, Durighello and Savoye acquired their al-Jazzār books. Yet it is striking that they all owned only small numbers of al-Jazzār books, which suggests that they were not able to extract books directly from the library. Instead, they probably bought them from previous owners long after the books had left the library. They must, thus, have been part of the constant trickle of books out of the library into local ownership over the course of the nineteenth century.

Extraction by a local nineteenth-century actor with a trajectory through a local private library is also possible in the case of the Jazzār handwritten book that is today in Staatsbibliothek Berlin and bears al-Jazzār's endowment seal, motto and statement. In Berlin, it is part of the Landberg subcollection of over 1,000 handwritten books that the library acquired in 1884 from Carlo Landberg who, in turn, had bought parts of the collection from the Egyptian scholar and book trader Amīn b. Ḥasan al-Ḥulwānī al-Madanī. The latter had travelled to Europe to sell his collection of some 3,000 handwritten books that were subsequently to also enlarge the collections of Leiden and

Oriental Printed Books and Manuscripts: Acquisition Invoices, 1892–1896). My thanks go to Victoria Ogunsanya (British Library) for providing this information.

119 Book note in hand of F. Macler on a paper slip pasted onto the inner front cover: 'Ce manuscrit m'a été donné à Damas en 1901, par M.P. Savoye, consul de France. F. Macler'. Also see Dussaud, "Rapport"; Dussaud, "Missions".

Princeton.[120] He had acquired the books from numerous private owners in the Hijaz, Damascus and Cairo, as Garret Davidson has shown.[121] It is, thus, possible that the Jazzār book in Berlin had also been in private ownership (or part of a private library) before it came into al-Madanī's ownership and before he sold it to Landberg.

The role of local actors in extracting al-Jazzār books that are today in European and US-American libraries is beyond doubt in the case of the largest sub-corpus. Almost all of the fifteen handwritten books held in Princeton's Garrett collection (six) and the Chester Beatty library in Dublin (nine) carry the endowment seal and most of them, the endowment motto and/or statement. The Princeton Garrett collection and the Chester Beatty library constitute a single corpus in terms of provenance of their Islamicate handwritten books. Many books in both collections were sold to the respective new owners, the American collector Robert S. Garrett (1875–1961) and the Irish-American collector Alfred Chester Beatty (1875–1968), by the same book trader and collector, Abraham Shalom Yahuda (1877–1951). Yahuda was in Acre in 1929 and described the Jazzār library in a letter to Alfred Chester Beatty, with whom he worked closely from 1927 onwards.[122] In this letter, Yahuda informed Chester Beatty that 'the last important [handwritten books] still left there [in the Jazzār library] I hope to get through a scholar there soon'.[123] We have no idea who this 'scholar' might have been and whether Yahuda did actually extract books from this library.

However, Yahuda must have been aware of the Jazzār library as he had sold a group of 126 handwritten books to Chester Beatty the previous year, 1928. As Moya Carey has shown, such acquisitions were recorded in the ART notebooks kept in Chester Beatty's collection. Here, the 126 books are recorded as coming from a 'very big old library'.[124] Among them are nine al-Jazzār books and they include some of the most spectacular that al-Jazzār had in his library, among them the *Fihrist* (*Catalogue*) of Ibn al-Nadīm (d. c. 380/990).[125] This is not only one of the most important sources for the intellectual and book history of the early Islamic period, but the Jazzār exemplar is one of the two earliest copies of this work and certainly ranks among the most spectacular early Arabic handwritten books in general. That one of the best-known Egyptian historians of the late medieval period, al-Maqrīzī (d. 845/1442), left a reader's note on it bears testament to its importance.[126] That it ended up in the ownership of Chester Beatty certainly reflects his interest in particularly old and valuable books.

The six Princeton books arguably come from the same 'very big old library'. In parallel to selling outstanding handwritten books to Chester Beatty, Yahuda built up his own research collection of rather less spectacular pieces. Yahuda sold his collection in 1942 to Robert S. Garrett, who, in turn, donated it to Princeton University Library.[127] It is, thus, probable that Yahuda split the books that he bought from the 'very big old library' into two groups, with the 126 more spectacular items going to Chester Beatty and the others staying in his private collection. The six Princeton al-Jazzār books are indeed less outstanding than their peers in Dublin.

From where did Yahuda buy the fifteen books that are today in Dublin and Princeton? The only information we have on the provenance of these

120 Rauch, "Wettkampfe", 123–127.

121 Davidson, "History of the Princeton University Library Collection", 425–434. On al-Madanī see Schwartz, "Eastern scholar's engagement".

122 Carey, "Real Mine".

123 Yahuda to Beatty, 15 May 1929, National Library of Israel Archives, MS. Var. Yah 38 01 217: Beatty A Chester.; quoted in Davidson, "History of the Princeton University Library Collection", 456.

124 ART C notebook as discussed and quoted by Carey, "Real Mine".

125 #998 in the Jazzār library inventory, today Chester Beatty Ar. 3315.

126 Dublin, Chester Beatty Library, Ar. 3315, fol. 1a.

127 Davidson, "History of the Princeton University Library Collection".

books is the reference to the unidentified 'big old library' in the ART notebook. It is very unlikely that this refers to the Jazzār library: The nine Chester Beatty library books definitely belong to the larger corpus of 126 books that come from this library. As discussed in the *Introduction* to this volume, we have checked all of these 126 books regarding possible provenance from the Jazzār library and 117 of them have no link to it whatsoever. Yahuda probably bought these books from intermediary dealers. As Lina Jabali shows in her ongoing work on the Yahuda collection in the National Library of Israel, Yahuda relied on a wide network of dealers, especially in Cairo, such as al-Khānjī, ʿAbd al-Ghanī al-Shihābī, Yūsuf Tūmā al-Bustānī (*Maktabt al-ʿArab*), Zaydān (*Maktabt Zaydān al-ʿUmūmiyya*) and Yūsuf Eliān Sarkīs libraries, as well as al-Hilāl press. Yahuda's connection with the Khānjī library is particularly well-documented, as is also shown in the work by Garrett Davidson. A slip in the hand of Sāmī Amīn al-Khānjī that is now in the Yahuda archive in Jerusalem shows that their dealings involved books from the Jazzār library. Here, al-Khānjī wrote: 'The *Dīwān* of […] Ibn al-Muʿtazz, a fine copy, a rare manuscript […] from the endowment of the Jazzār library in Akka.'[128] This book is indeed listed in the Jazzār library inventory (#1195) and is no longer in Akka. Such slips were typical for the books that Yahuda acquired from al-Khānjī, but Yahuda must have sold it to another customer as we have not been able to identify this manuscript in Dublin, Princeton or the National Library of Israel.

The manuscripts that went through the hands of Yahuda are, thus, another case of books from the Jazzār library initially moving into local or regional ownership and subsequently being purchased for the European/US-American market. The scenario might be different for the Princeton books (or some of them) as we cannot be certain that all of them go back to the same 'big old library' as those in Dublin. Yahuda plainly states his intention in the 1929 letter from Acre to directly remove books from the Jazzār library. Considering his success in navigating difficult purchases,[129] it is possible that this happened here and that at least some of the six Princeton books were directly removed from the Jazzār library.

6 Conclusion

The initial question posed in this chapter, where have all the books gone, is still, to a large extent, an open question, as the current whereabouts of the vast majority of the Jazzār handwritten books remain unknown. It can only be hoped that this book leads to increased awareness of the Jazzār collection and that more will be identified in the future. However, even based on the small corpus identified so far and a consideration of their trajectories, it can be argued that the demise of the Jazzār library was a gradual and protracted process over the course of the nineteenth century. This was not a linear process of decline; the early twentieth century witnessed a remarkable renewal of the library driven by individuals such as ʿAbd Allāh al-Jazzār that was part of a much wider development in which libraries in Greater Syria were reconfigured and rebuilt by individuals such as Muḥammad al-Ḥabbāl. This renewal was arguably also a reaction to the fact that the Jazzār library, and other libraries, had lost so many books in the course of the nineteenth century.

Yet, there is no indication that European traders had direct access to the library during the nineteenth century. Instead, all books that show any evidence of having left the library during this period went into local private libraries first and were then either re-endowed or sold to new owners, non-European or European. In contrast to what one might have assumed, this is, to a large extent, a

128 A.S. Yahuda Archive, National Library of Israel Archives. I am grateful to Lina Jabali who made a reproduction of this slip available and provided me with the contextual information.

129 Carey, "Real Mine".

local and regional story driven by scholars, librarians and notables in the region—and not a story driven by outside statesmen, consuls and traders. The story of the translocation of written artefacts from West Asia and North Africa to Europe and the US in this period seems to be different for non-Muslim books that were much more in the focus of European and US-American scholarship. Regarding Christian handwritten books from the Sinai, for instance, and Jewish material from the Cairo Geniza corpus, there is a much stronger role of non-local and non-regional actors.[130] Yet, the trajectory of written artefacts from collections such as the Jazzār library or the Damascene Qubbat al-Khazna was clearly a very different story.[131]

Bibliography

Acıl, Berat (ed.). *Osmanlı kitap kültürü: Carullah Efendi kütüphanesi ve derkenar notları*. Istanbul, 2015.

Afaneh, Hosam El Din (ʿAfāna, Ḥusām al-Dīn) et al. *Fihris makhṭūṭāt Filasṭīn al-muṣawwara*. 5 vols. Jerusalem, 2000–2012.

Aljoumani, Said. "Tārīkh maktabat al-Mullā ʿUthmān al-Kurdī bi-Dimashq iʿtimādan ʿalā khawārij makhṭūṭātihā." *Journal of the Institute of Arabic Manuscripts* 65, no. 1 (2021): 210–260.

Aljoumani, Said, Burak, Guy and Hirschler, Konrad. *List of Identified al-Jazzār Manuscripts and Their Current Location*, Research Data Repository of Universität Hamburg, https://doi.org/10.25592/uhhfdm.14178.

Amit, Gish. "Salvage or Plunder? Israel's 'Collection' of Private Palestinian Libraries in West Jerusalem." *Journal of Palestine Studies* 40, no. 4 (2011): 6–23.

ʿAṭāʾ Allāh, Maḥmūd ʿAlī. *Fihris makhṭūṭāt al-Maktaba al-Aḥmadiyya fī ʿAkkā*. 1983.

ʿAṭāʾ Allāh, Maḥmūd ʿAlī. *Fihris makhṭūṭāt al-Maktaba al-Islamiyya fī Yāfā*. 1984.

Baffioni, Carmela. *Fondation Sidi Mohamed Ould Habott. Bibliothèque des manuscrits*. Siena/Chinguetti, 2006.

Bağcı, Serpil and Zeynep Yürekli. "Book-Picking in a Conquered Citadel." In *Crafting History: Essays on the Ottoman World and Beyond in Honor of Cemal Kafadar*, edited by R. Goshgarian, I. Khouri-Makdisi and A. Yaycıoğlu, 77–103. Boston, MA, 2023.

Barakat, Bashir. *Tārīkh al-maktabāt al-ʿArabiyya fī Bayt al-Maqdis*. Riyadh, 2012.

Carey, Moya. "'A Real Mine for All Kinds of Research': Abraham Yahuda's Exchanges with Chester Beatty, and the Introduction of Arabic Rare Texts." In *A.S. Yahuda as Cultural Broker. Between Near Eastern Philology and the Manuscript Trade* (working title), edited by Stephanie Luescher, Marina Rustow and Samuel Thrope. Forthcoming.

Ciotti, Giovanni, Michael Kohs, Eva Wilden and Hanna Wimmer. *Definition of Paracontent*, CSMC Occasional Paper No. 6, Hamburg, 2018.

Conermann, Stephan and Michael Kemper. *The Heritage of Soviet Oriental Studies*. Abingdon, Oxfordshire, 2011.

Conrad, Lawrence I. "The Khalidi Library." In *Ottoman Jerusalem: The Living City: 1517–1917*, edited by Sylvia Auld and Robert Hillenbrand, 191–209. London, 2000.

Conrad, Lawrence I. "Ibn Aʿtham and His History." *al-ʿUṣūr al-Wusṭā* 23 (2015): 87–125

Al-Dajānī, Aḥmad Zakī. *Madīnat Yāfā fī dhākirat al-taʾrīkh*. N.p., n.d.

Darrāj, Aḥmad. *L'Acte de waqf de Barsbay* (*Ḥujjat waqf Barsbay*). Cairo, 1963.

Davidson, Garret. "On the History of the Princeton University Library Collection of Islamic Manuscripts." *Journal of Islamic Manuscripts* 13 (2022): 421–479.

D'hulster, Kristof. *Browsing through the Sultan's Bookshelves. Towards a Reconstruction of the Library of the Mamluk Sultan Qāniṣawh al-Ghawrī (r. 906–922/1501–1516)*. Göttingen, 2021. Dussaud, René. "Rapport à M. le Secrétaire perpétuel sur une mission dans le désert de Syrie." *Comptes rendus des séances de*

130 See for instance Jefferson, "Trade in Cairo Genizah fragments"; Peter Tarras. "A Blog Dedicated to the Dispersed Manuscript Heritage of Saint Catherine's Monastery", April 2023 https://medisi.hypotheses.org/5 (accessed 1 September 2023).

131 Erbay/Hirschler, "Middle Eastern Agency".

l'Académie des Inscriptions et Belles-Lettres Année 46, no. 3 (1902): 251–264.

Dussaud, René. "Missions de la Ville de Paris." *Annuaires de l'École pratique des hautes études* (1902): 90–111.

El Shamsy, Ahmed. *Rediscovering the Islamic Classics. How Editors and Print Culture Transformed an Intellectual Tradition*. Princeton, 2020.

Erbay, Cüneyd and Konrad Hirschler. "Writing Middle Eastern Agency into the History of the Qubbat al-khazna. The Late Ottoman State and Manuscripts as Historical Artefacts." In *The Damascus Fragments: Towards a History of the Qubbat al-khazna Corpus of Manuscripts and Documents*, edited by Arianna D'Ottone Rambach, Konrad Hirschler and Ronny Vollandt, 151–178. Beirut, 2020.

Ghosheh, Mohammad H. *Encyclopœdia Palestinnica*, vol. 16: *Manuscripts and libraries in Palestine* (*1516–1918*). Amman, 2019.

Al-Ḥabbāl, Muḥammad b. Maḥmūd. *Barnāmaj al-Maktaba al-Khālidiyya al-ʿumūmiyya*. Jerusalem, 1900.

Ḥamāda, Jalāl Muḥammad. *ʿĀshiq al-kutub. Aḥmad Khayrī Bek, sīrat shakhṣ wa-masīrat maktaba*. Amman, 2023.

Hirschler, Konrad. *Medieval Damascus: Plurality and Diversity in an Arabic Library. The Ashrafīya Library Catalogue*. Edinburgh, 2016.

Hirschler, Konrad. *A Monument to Medieval Syrian Book Culture. The Library of Ibn ʿAbd al-Hādī*. Edinburgh, 2020.

Ibn al-Zubayr al-Aswānī. *Umnīyat al-almaʿī wa-manīyat al-muddaʿī*. Edited by Ṭ. Al-Jazāʾirī. Jerusalem, 1900.

Al-Jazāʾirī, Ṭāhir. *Al-Tadhkira*. Damascus, National al-Asad Library, MS 11728.

Jefferson, Rebecca J.W. "The Trade in Cairo Genizah Fragments in and out of Palestine in the Late 19th and Early 20th Centuries." *Journal of Ancient Judaism* 14 (2023): 1–30.

Khālidī, Walīd. *al-Maktaba al-Khālidiyya fī al-Quds: 1720–2001*. Beirut, 2002.

Kurd ʿAlī, Muḥammad. "Baḍʿat ayyām fī al-Jalīl." *al-Muqtabas* 76 (1912): 373.

Liebrenz, Boris. *Die Rifāʿīya aus Damaskus. Eine Privatbibliothek im osmanischen Syrien und ihr kulturelles Umfeld*. Leiden, 2016.

Lorusso, Vito. *Searching for a Definition of "Manuscript"*. CSMC Occasional Paper no. 1, 2015. http://doi.org/10.25592/uhhfdm.9796.

Mannāʿ, ʿĀdil. "al-Nukhba al-Maqdisiyya ʿulamāʾ al-madīna wa-aʿyānuhā." *Ḥawliyat al-Quds* 5 (2007): 5–46.

Mannāʿ, ʿĀdil. *Aʿlām Filasṭīn fī awākhir al-ʿahd al-ʿuthmānī, 1800–1918*. Beirut, 1995.

Meryon, Charles Lewis. *Travels of Lady Hester Stanhope*. 2 vols. London, 1846.

Al-Mubayyaḍ, Salīm ʿArafāt, Muḥammad Khālid Kullāb. *Maktabat al-Jāmiʿ al-ʿUmarī al-Kabīr bi-madīnat Ghazza*. Amman 2013.

Muḥaybish, Ghassān. "Mujammaʿ al-Jazzār al-khayrī fī ʿAkkā." unpubl. MA thesis, al-Quds University, 1996.

Muḥaybish, Ghasān. "*Al-Madrasa al-Aḥmadiyya wa-al-maktaba al-Aḥmadiyya fi ʿAkkā*." In *Aḥmad Pāshā al-Jazzār. 200 ʿām ʿalā wafātihi*, edited by Shukrī ʿArrāf and Yaʿqūb Ḥijāzī, 170–776, ʿAkkā, 2004.

Mukhliṣ, ʿAbd Allāh. "Kitāb Rawḍat al-faṣāḥa." *Majallat al-Majmaʿ al-ʿIlmī al-ʿArabī* 22.9–10 (September 1947): 418–426.

Mukhliṣ, ʿAbd Allāh. "Kitāb Taḥrīr al-taḥbīr fī ʿilm al-badīʿ." *Majallat al-Majmaʿ al-ʿIlmī al-ʿArabī* 22.11–12 (October 1947): 524–531.

Mukhliṣ, ʿAbd Allāh. "Majmūʿat ashʿār." *Majallat al-Majmaʿ al-ʿIlmī al-ʿArabī* 21.11–12 (October 1946): 544–547.

Al-Munajjid, Ṣalāḥ al-Dīn. *al-Makhṭūṭāt al-ʿArabiyya fī Filasṭīn*. Beirut, 1982.

Al-Nabhanī, Yūsuf b. Ismāʿīl. *al-Sharaf al-muʾabbad li-Āl-Muḥammad ṣallā allāh alayhī wa-sallama*. 2015.

Pohl, Joh. *Führer durch die Bibliotheken Palästinas*. 1938.

Rauch, Christoph. "‚Im Wettkampfe mit den Bibliotheken anderer Nationen': Die Königliche Bibliothek zu Berlin und der Erwerb arabischer Handschriftensammlungen zwischen 1850 und 1900." In *Sammler—Bibliothekare—Forscher: Beiträge zur Geschichte der Orientalischen Sammlungen an der Staatsbibliothek zu Berlin*, edited by Sabine Mangold-Will, Christoph Rauch and Siegfried Schmitt, 87–150. Frankfurt/M., 2022.

Al-Rayḥānī, Amīn. *Al-Nakabāt. Khulāṣat taʾrīkh Sūriyya mundhu alʿahd al-awwal baʿd al-ṭūfān ilā ʿahd al-jumhūriyya bi-Lubnān*. Beirut, 1948.

Sayyid, A.F. *Dār al-Kutub al-Miṣrīya: taʾrīkhuhā wa-taṭawwuruhā*, Cairo, 1996.

Schwartz, Kathryn. "An Eastern Scholar's Engagement with the European Study of the East: Amin al-Madani and the Sixth Oriental Congress Leiden, 1883." In *The Muslim Reception of European Orientalism: Reversing the Gaze*, edited by Susanah Heschel and Umar Ryad, 39–60. Philadelphia, 2020.

Ṭarrāzī, Fīlīb Dī. *Tārīkh al-ṣaḥāfa al-ʿarabīya*. Beirut, 1913.

Ṭarrāzī, Fīlīb Dī. *Khazāʾin al-kutub al-ʿarabiyya fī al-khāfiqayn*, Beirut, 1947–1951.

Ullmann, Manfred. *Die Natur- und Geheimwissenschaften im Islam*, Leiden, 1972.

Wallach, Yair. *A City in Fragments. Urban Text in Modern Jerusalem*. Stanford, CA, 2020.

Al-Wāsiṭī, Muḥammad b. Aḥmad. *Faḍāʾil al-Bayt al-Muqaddas*. Edited by Isaac Hasson. Jerusalem, 1979.

Al-Wāsiṭī, Muḥammad b. Aḥmad. *Faḍāʾil al-Bayt al-Muqaddas*. Edited by Abū al-Munzir. Nicosia, 2010.

Yūsuf Ḥasan, Aḥmad. "al-Madrasa al-Aḥmadiyya fī ʿAkkā." *al-Muntadī* 1 (1943): 16.

Zaydān, Jurjī. *Tārīkh ādāb al-lugha al-ʿarabīya*. Cairo, 1911–1914.